Authenticity of the Qur'an

asalamu alaykoum dear brothers and sisters, I wanted to ask a long question about the authenticity of our holy book just so I can get a deeper understanding on this matter. some non muslims claim that our quran was changed after our dear prophet mouhammed peace be upon him died, they use ahadith from sahih boukhari in order to bring doubt, the famous ones they used are: umar ibn khatab radia lah aanhou (claimed that there is verses missing about stoning adulterers) and the second one was boukhari 6:527 where umar said Ubai was the best of us in the recitation (of the Qur'an) yet we leave some of what he recites. Ubai says, 'PI have taken it from the mouth of Allah's Apostle and will not leave for anything whatever. "Can you please explain to me these ahadiths and also I have a question thats different from this topic which is about the 7 different quiraat of the quran besides the chakel and a few letters that differs, does it have whole words that are different?

iaazakoum lah khayran:

The authenticity of the Qur'an is established in such a way that made even a writer as William Muir (d. 1905) admit:

There is probably in the world no other work which has remained twelve centuries with so pure a text.

The Qur'an is mutawatir (יצויג)—that is, transmitted by means of tawatur (יצויע)—from the Prophet Muḥammad ﷺ in each and every verse of it down to this day.2

^{*} Islam9834, "Authenticity of the Qur'an", Islam Publications & Research, or, Islam.com https://qa.islam.com/s/dt6tco/authenticity_of_the_qur_an accessed 11 February 2020.

¹ William Muir, introduction to chapter first in *The Life of Mahomet and History of Islam, to the Era of the Hegira*, i (London: Smith, Elder & Co., 1858), xiv-xv.

The Muslim scholars are unanimous on this. See also Shady Hekmat Nasser, The Transmission of the Variant Readings of the Qur'ān: The Problem of Tawātur and the Emergence of Shawādhdh (Leiden: Koninklijke Brill NV, 2013), 89, 230; Muḥammad Hādī Ma^crifah (Shia scholar), Şiyānah al-Qur'ān min al-Taḥrīf (3rd ed., Qum:

Mutawātir means that something is transmitted by multitudes of people at all times and at all stages such that collusion in forgery becomes impossible due to their large number.

The exact number is irrelevant: the important condition is that the possibility of coincidence or "organised falsehood" be obviously negligible.

And if something is *mutawātir* then it yields certainty or certain knowledge (*'ilm*; yaqīn; qaṭ'), whether of contemporary or of past events.

Something that is *mutawātir* is common knowledge and is *not* in need of a chain of transmission (*isnād*) because it is transmitted by multitudes of people and because an *isnād* is required to corroborate the authenticity of a report or transmission that is in doubt, and a *mutawātir* report or transmission is not in doubt.³

Examples of *mutawātir* transmissions include knowledge of accounts like the Holocaust, the independence of India from the British rule in 1947, the Hijrah of the Prophet Muḥammad from Mecca to Medina in AD 622 and his birth in Mecca, the existence of distant cities and countries and of ancient figures like Aristotle, Plato, Socrates, Alexander the Great, and so on.

Some of the examples of the *mutawātir* practices (*sunan*; sunnahs) are the five daily prayers (*ṣalāh*), fasting (*ṣawm*), zakāt (*zakāh*), ḥajj, and recitation of the Qur'ān.

Transmissions that are *not mutawātir* are called $\bar{a}h\bar{a}d$ ($^{3}\Box^{3}$), meaning solitary or narrated by only a few, and it is this kind of transmissions that are in need of a chain of transmission ($isn\bar{a}d$) or reference to particular transmitter(s).

All this has been substantiated in the journal articles I have referred to in the section on further reading.

And an aḥād ḥadīth does not yield certainty, even if it is saḥīḥ.

Al-Nawawī (d. 676/1277) unequivocally states:

Mu'assasah al-Nashr al-Islāmī, 1428/[2007/8]), 23-4, 37.

³ Țāhir al-Jazā'irī al-Dimashqī (d. 1338/1920), *Tawjīh al-Nazar ilā Uṣūl al-Athar*, ed. 'Abd al-Fattāḥ Abū Ghuddah (Aleppo: Maktab al-Maṭbū'āt al-Islāmiyyah, 1416/1995), **136-7**.

⁴ Ibid.

وإذا قيل صحيح فهذا معناه، لا أنه مقطوع به

He further writes:

وذكر الشيخ أن ما روياه أو أحدهما فهو مقطوع بصحته، والعلم القطعي حاصل فيـه، وخالفه المحققون والأكثرون؛ فقالوا: يغيد الظن ما لم يتواتر، والله أعلم

And the Shaykh [Taqī al-Dīn Ibn al-Ṣalāḥ (d. 643/1245)] stated that what[ever] they both [al-Bukhārī (d. 256/870) and Muslim (d. 261/875)] have reported or either one of them then that is certain ($maqt\bar{u}$) as to its authenticity and it yields certain knowledge (al-ilm al-qati), but he has been opposed by the researchers (al- $muḥaqqiq\bar{u}n$) and the majority [of the scholars] (wa'l- $akthar\bar{u}n$) that it yields uncertain knowledge (zann) only unless it is $mutaw\bar{a}tir$, and Allah knows better.

Al- (Irāgī (d. 806/1404) said:

وبالصحيح والضعيف قصدوا في ظاهر لا القطع ...

And by ṣaḥīḥ and ḍa'īf they [the scholars] mean apparently, not certainty ... "

The great Shia scholar al-Sharīf al-Murtaḍā (d. 436/1044), answering the question of how the Prophet could have married $^{\zeta}$ ishah, who would later become a disbeliever in Imāmī Shī $^{\zeta}$ eyes for battling $^{\zeta}$ Alī, replied that the Prophet did not know that she would do this and that the only

⁵ Muḥyī al-Dīn ibn Sharaf al-Nawawī, *al-Taqrīb wa'l-Taysīr li-Ma'rifah Sunan al-Bashīr al-Nadhīr*, ed. Muḥammad 'Uthmān al-Khusht (Beirut: Dār al-Kitāb al-'Arabī, 1405/1985), **25**.

⁶ Ibid. 28. For a detailed discussion on this issue, see al-Nawawī, introduction (muqaddimah) in Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim bi-Sharḥ al-Nawawī, i ([Cairo]: al-Maṭba^cah al-Miṣriyyah, 1347/1929), 19-21, 131-2.

⁷ Abū 'l-Faḍl Zayn al-Dīn al-ʿIrāqī, Alfiyyah al-Ḥadīth, or, al-Tabṣirah wa'l-Tadhkirah fī 'Ulūm al-Ḥadīth, ed. al-ʿArabī al-Dā'iz al-Faryāṭī (Riyadh: Maktabah Dār al-Minhāj, 1426/[2005/6]), 68 l. 14. A similar statement is made by Taqī al-Dīn Abū 'Amr Ibn al-Ṣalāḥ, Muqaddimah Ibn al-Ṣalāḥ wa-Maḥāsin al-Iṣṭilāḥ, ed. 'Ā'ishah 'Abd al-Raḥmān (new ed., Cairo: Dār al-Maʿārif, 1409/1989), 152: "And when they [the scholars of the Ḥadīths] say, 'This ḥadīth is ṣaḥīḥ,' then the meaning of it is that its chain of transmission (isnād) consists of all the said qualities. And it is not of its condition that it be certain in reality, ... (أنه اتصل سنده، مع سائر الأوصاف المذكودة. وليس من شلطه أن يكون مقطوعاً به في نفس الأمر، …"

proof that he did is the hadīth "You will fight him [SAIT] and you will be in the wrong (satuqātilīnahu wa-anti zālimah lahu)," and this "appears only via āḥād means the likes of which cannot be considered certain."

And all the hadīths in the Ḥadīth literature—including the hadīths in Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī and Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim—are āḥād only, and, hence, do not yield certainty.

Ibn al-Ṣalāḥ—a Ḥadīth scholar who, based on some other reasons, was of the opinion that the ḥadīths in Ṣaḥīḥ al-īBukhārī and Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim yield certainty—explicitly states that in the discourse of the Ḥadīth scholars or traditionists (muḥaddithūn) the taxonomy of the mutawātir is nowhere to be found, and this, he says, is due to the fact that such ḥadīths do not constitute part of their riwāyahs.

Ibn al-Ṣalāḥ himself acknowledged that the traditionists' repertoire of ḥadīth does not include the mutawātir category.

But Ibn al-Ṣalāḥ said more:

ومن سئل عن إبراز مثال لذلك فيما يروى من الحديث أعياه تطلبه

And the one who is asked to produce an example of such a hadīth [$mutaw\bar{a}tir$] will be exhausted by his search. ¹⁰

In his own search for such hadīths, he could cite **only one**: "He who intentionally lies concerning something I [viz., the Prophet] have said will gain a seat in Hellfire" ¹¹.

¹⁰ **Ibid. 454**.

¹¹ Ibid.: من كذب علي متعمدا فليتبوأ مقعده من الناد. According to some other scholars, as will follow, even this hadith is not

The other hadīth which he could find that seemingly met the standards of the *mutawātir* was "Acts are judged by intentions". However, he acknowledges that although this hadīth was reportedly narrated by a *mutawātir* number of transmitters, its apodictic manner of transmission occurred in the middle tiers of transmission, *not* from the outset 12.

Al-Nawawī also agrees with this conclusion. 13

Al-Shāţibī (d. 790/1388) said:

بل قد أعوز أن يوجد حديث عن رسول الله ﷺ متواترا

In fact, I am still short of finding a hadith from the Messenger of Allah as as mutawātir.14

Al-Shāṭibī also argues that discussions concerning the certainty of *mutawātir* ḥadīths are mostly hypothetical, since it is **unlikely to find such ḥadīths surviving in their** *mutawātur* **form** until such later time when a hitherto unsolved legal case (*wāqi^cah*) occurs.¹⁵

On at least two separate occasions al-Shāṭibī remarks that with the lapse of time the mutawātir ḥadīths have become so few that they are on the verge of extinction. 16

mutawātir because some of its transmission do not include the word "intentionally (muta ammid")", and this makes a whole lot of difference and changes its import significantly. See also Shees Hassan Shaikh, "How can we be sure that a hadith is the actual uttering of the Prophet? (Dr Jonathan AC Brown)", YouTube https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zzPY0HT0Moc accessed 17 February 2020.

وحديث "إنما الأعمال بالنيات" ليس من ذلك بسبيل وإن نقله عدد التواتر وزيادة، لأن ذلك طرأ عليه في وسط إسناده ولم يوجد في أوائله _j الما 12 [

ومنه المتواتر المعروف في الفقه وأصوله، ولا يذكره المحدثون، وهو قليل لا يكاد يوجد في الفقه وأصوله، ولا يذكره المحدثون، وهو قليل لا يكاد يوجد في "من كذب علي متعمدا فليتبوأ مقعده من النار" متواتر، رواياتهم، وهو ما نقله من يحصل العلم بصدقهم ضرورة عن مثلهم من أوله إلى آخره، وحديث "من كذب علي متعمدا فليتبوأ مقعده من النار" متواتر، واياتهم، وهو ما نقله من يحصل العلم بصدقهم ضرورة عن مثلهم من أوله إلى آخره، وحديث "من كذب علي متعمدا فليتبوأ مقعده من النار" متواتر،

¹⁴ Abū Isḥāq Ibrāhīm ibn Mūsā al-Shāṭibī, *al-Istiṣām*, ed. Salīm ibn sīd al-Hilālī (Khobar: Dār Ibn sAffān, 1412/1992), **145**.

¹⁵ al-Shāṭibī, al-Muwāfaqāt fī Uṣūl al-Aḥkām, ed. Muḥammad Muḥyī al-Dīn 'Abd al-Ḥamīd, iv (Cairo: [Maṭba'ah Muḥammad 'Alī Ṣubayḥ], [1389/90]/1970), 8 II. 19-21 (cited in Wael B. Hallaq, "The Primacy of the Qur'ān in Shāṭibī's Legal Theory", in Wael B. Hallaq and Donald P. Little, eds, Islamic Studies Presented to Charles J. Adams (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1991), 78 n. 38): فإن ما ذكر من تواتد الأخباد إنما غالبه فرض أمد جائذ، ولعلك لا تجد في الأخباد النبوية عن غير واقع أو في نادر الوقوع، ولا كبير جدوى فيه

¹⁶ al-Shāṭibī, al-Muwāfaqāt, ii, 34; iv, 8 (cited in Hallaq, "Primacy of the Qur'ān", 88 n. 72).

Ibn Hibban al-Bustī (d. 354/965) said:

فأما الأخبار، فإنها كلها أخبار الآحاد، لأنه ليس يوجد عن النبي ﷺ خبر عن رواية عدلين، روى أحدهما عن عدلين، وكل واحد منهما عن عدلين، وكل واحد منهما عن عدلين، حتى ينتهي ذلك إلى رسول الله ﷺ، فلما استحال هذا، وبطل، ثبت أن الأخبار كلهـا أخبـار الآحاد، ...

So, as for the [ḥadīth] reports, then all of them are non-mutawātir reports (akhbār al-āḥād), for there is not found [any] report from the Prophet state from the narration of two trustworthy narrators ('adlayn), one of whom narrating from [another] two trustworthy narrators, and each one of both [narrating] from [another] two trustworthy narrators till it reaches back to the Messenger of Allah state; so when this is proved to be impossible and false, it became established that the reports are all non-mutawātir reports, ...¹⁷

So, we see that the Muslim scholars—both legalist and traditionist, and Sunni as well as Shia—themselves admitted that even a <code>ṣaḥīḥ</code> ḥadīth does not yield certainty.

We also saw that the Sunni Muslim scholars—legalist and traditionist—who were fond of the notion of the variant readings of the Qur'ān or its revelation according to the "seven aḥruf"—admit that no mutawātir ḥadīths are present in the Sunni Ḥadīth literature at all.

So, we conclude that the Qur'an yields certainty because each and every verse of it is mutawātir, whereas the hadīths in the Hadīth literature of the Sunnis do not yield certainty because none of them are mutawātir.

¹⁷ Abū Ḥātim Muḥammad Ibn Ḥibbān al-Ibustī, al-Iḥsān fī Taqrīb Ṣaḥīḥ Ibn Ḥibbān, ed. Shu'ayb al-Arna'ūṭ, i (Beirut: Mu'assasah al-Risālah, 1408/1988), 156; Abū Bakr Muḥammad ibn Mūsā al-Ḥāzimī, Shurūṭ al-A'immah al-Khamsah, ed. Muḥammad Zāhid al-Kawtharī ([Cairo]: al-Maktabah al-Azhariyyah li'l-Turāth, [[1425/6]/2005]), 26. It is noteworthy here that the definition of mutawātir for the legalist scholars (uṣūlīs) is different than that for the traditionists (muḥaddithūn)—a discussion which is covered in the journal articles referred to in the section on further reading—yet it makes no difference here because I have cited scholars belonging to both camps—legalists as well as traditionists—attesting to the fact the mutawātir is simply non-existent in the Ḥadīth literature, because, as explained earlier and even admitted by scholars like Ibn al-Ṣalāḥ and al-Nawawī (see notes 9 and 13), the mutawātir transmissions are not in need of a chain of transmission (isnād) in the first place (see notes 3 and 4).

Therefore, to claim about the Qur'ān—which is certain—that there were some of its verses which are not present in it now on the basis of the Hadīths—which are uncertain—is absurd.

Similarly, to claim on the basis of the Ḥadīths that some of the verses of the Qur'ān have been abrogated (mansūkh) and are no longer valid is also absurd.

Same is the case with the so-called "seven readings (al- $qir\bar{a}'\bar{a}t$ al-sab)" or the "ten readings (al- $qir\bar{a}'\bar{a}t$ al-sab)" of the Qur'ān.

Al-Zarkashī (d. 794/1392) writes:

... القراءات السبع متواترة عند الجمهور، وقيل بل مشهورة، ... والتحقيق أنها متواترة عن الأئمة السبعة، أما تواترها عن النبي وين فيه نظر؛ فإن إسناد الأئمة السبعة بهذه القراءات السبعة موجود في كتب القراءات، وهي نقل الواحد عن النبي وين عن الواحد لم تكمل شروط التواتر في استواء الطرفين والواسطة، وهذا شيء موجود في كتبهم، وقد أشار الشيخ شهاب الدين أبو شامة في كتابه "المرشد الوجيز" إلى شيء من ذلك،

... The "seven readings" are mutawātir according to the majority [of the scholars], and it is also said [that they are] rather mashhūr (merely "famous", [not mutawātir]). ... The truth is that they are mutawātir from the "seven imāms [readers]". As far as their tawātur from the Prophet sis concerned, this is debatable, for the chain of narrators (isnād) of these seven imāms for these seven readings are found in the

Unfortunately, this "common reading" of the Qur'ān later came to be identified with the reading of Ḥafṣ from (ʿan) ʿĀṣim (عفون علامه), and this probably caused some confusion, which perhaps led scholars like al-Zarkashī and al-Shawkānī to deem all the readings of the Qur'ān as non-mutawātir (āḥād) (see notes 19 and 21). Also, the Shias read the Qur'ān according to this reading only and reject the notion of the seven or the ten variant readings and/or aḥruf: Maʿrifah, Ṣiyānah al-Qur'ān, 16-17, 23-4, 37; Nasser, Transmission of the Variant Readings, 32-3, 112-15. It is also noteworthy here that although some of the Shias used to believe in the notion of the distortion/falsification/alteration (taḥrīf) of the Qur'ān, they are now coming forward to admit that the Qur'ān has in fact been free from any distortion or corruption: Muḥammad Muṣṭafā al-Aʿzamī, The History of the Qur'ānic Text: From Revelation to Compilation: A Comparative Study with the Old and New Testaments (Leicester: UK Islamic Academy, [2003]), 198 n. 11; Maʿrifah, Ṣiyānah al-Qur'ān, especially 16-17, 23-4, 37.

books of the readings ($qir\bar{a}'\bar{a}t$), and it is transmission from single [person] to single [person] ($naql\ al-w\bar{a}hid\ ^can\ al-w\bar{a}hid\)$, which does not fulfil the conditions of $taw\bar{a}tur$, neither at the ends nor in the middle, and this is present in their books. And Shaykh Shihāb al-Dīn Abū Shāmah had pointed some of this out in his book $al-Murshid\ al-Wajīz$. ¹⁹

He also writes:

قال أبو عبد الرحمن السلمي: كانت قراءة أبي بكر وعمر وعثمان وزيد بن ثابت والمهاجرين والأتصار واحدة، كانوا يقرءون القراءة العامة، وهي القراءة التي قرأها رسول الله على جبريل مرتين في العام الذي قبض فيه، وكان زيد قد شهد العرضة الأخيرة، وكان يقرئ الناس بها حتى مات، ...

Abū 'Abd al-Raḥmān al-Sulamī (d. 73-4/692-3) said: "The reading of Abū Bakr, 'Umar, 'Uthmān, Zayd ibn Thābit, the Muhājirūn, and the Anṣār was one: they would read [the Qur'ān according to] al-qirā'ah al-'āmmah ('the common reading'), and that is the [same] reading that the Prophet is had read out to Jibrīl [Gabriel] twice in the year he [later] passed away. And Zayd had witnessed al-'arḍah al-akhīrah ('the last presentation' or 'the final recital') and he taught people the same till he died ..." 20

Al-Shawkānī (d. 1250/1834) states:

وقد ادعي تواتر كل واحدة من القراءات السبع، ... وادعي _ أيضا _ تواتر القراءات العشر، ... وليس على ذلك أثارة من ... وليس على ذلك أثارة ولا أثارة القراء ال

¹⁹ Badr al-Dīn Muḥammad ibn 'Abd Allāh al-Zarkashī, *al-Burhān fī 'Ulūm al-Qur'ān*, ed. Muḥammad Abū 'l-Faḍl Ibrāhīm, i (Cairo: Maktabah Dār al-Turāth, 1376/1957), **318-19**.

²⁰ Ibid. 237.

²¹ Muḥammad ibn ʿAlī al-Shawkānī, *Irshād al-Fuḥūl ilā Taḥqīq al-Ḥaqq min ʿIlm al-Uṣūl*, ed. Abū Ḥafṣ Sāmī ibn al-ʿArabī al-Atharī, i (Riyadh: Dār al-Faḍīlah, 1421/2000), 172-4.

The other readings of the Qur'an were not always accepted as canonical or authentic because they had met the technical requirements for tawatur but simply because they had some isnad support and had become widely accepted.

So, we see that there is *only one* reading of the Qur'an that is authentic and *mutawatir* (certain) in the true sense.

A Muslim perspective

The Qur'an was originally revealed to the Prophet Muḥammad sees as an oral revelation although it was later put down in writing.

In fact, the Arabic word $qur'\bar{a}n$ (\ddot{c})—from the root q-r-' (\ddot{c})—itself means a "reading", a "recitation", a "discourse".²³

So the Qur'an is actually that which is read/recited, and that is what matters.

So if someone adds sūrah separators, *āyah* separators, *āyah* numbers, sūrah names, diacritics, or anything of the sort to the written copies of the Qur'ān, or uses a different orthography, it all makes no difference, since the actual Qur'ān is that which is read/recited.

As yet, we don't even have a complete Qur'ān manuscript that dates back exactly to the lifetime of the Prophet but only four pages²⁴.

And Allah (God) had already said to the Prophet that it was His (God's own) responsibility to compile the Qur'an and read it out and then to clarify or explain it to the Prophet and that he

²² Qur'an 75:16-19, 96:1.

²³ Edward William Lane, An Arabic-English Lexicon, vii (ed. Stanley Lane-Poole, London: Williams and Norgate, 1885; Beirut: Librairie du Liban, 1968), 2502, 2504, under "1. خنة" and "أَنْ الله " respectively http://lexicon.quranic-research.net/data/21_q/048_qr0.html accessed 11 February 2020. See also Qur'ān 39:27-8.

²⁴ Cadbury Research Library, "The Birmingham Qur'an Manuscript", Flickr https://www.flickr.com/photos/cadburyresearchlibrary/albums/72157655161018888 accessed 11 February 2020.

then should follow the same reading²⁵, so the Prophet would not have had any doubts as to the beginning and the end of a particular sūrah nor do we.

And, as we saw above, an oral transmission in itself yields certainty (yaqīn) if it's mutawātir, i.e. if it's transmitted by means of tawātur, and each and every verse of the Qur'ān has been passed down to us since the time of and by the Prophet via tawātur.

... The scholars of the ummah have unanimously agreed that the Prophet promulgated the Qur'ān among the ummah by relaying it publicly and unequivocally to everyone in ways that eliminated confusion (shubhah); for this very reason, the Qur'ān's absoluteness (ḥujjah) was established. The Prophet did not spread some parts of the Qur'ān more frequently than he did with some other parts, nor did he read parts of it to certain people and excluded others from receiving some of its other parts. Similarly, the Prophet did not explain to one or two Companions only that some verses are Qur'ānic while others are not. The Prophet disseminated the Qur'ān publicly and equally among the whole ummah. ...²⁶

Allah says:

O (the) Messenger, convey/promulgate (balligh) what has been sent down/revealed towards you from your Lord, and if you did not then you have not conveyed/promulgated His Message (risālatahu); and Allah will protect/protects you from the people; verily, Allah does not guide the disbelieving people.²⁷

Allah also says:

Verily, it is We Who have sent down/revealed the Message/Reminder (al-Dhikr), and

²⁵ Qur'ān 75:16-19. This should explain why the Qur'ān we posses today does not have a chronological order.

²⁶ Nasser, *Transmission of the Variant Readings*, 92; Abū Bakr ibn al-Ṭayyib al-Bāqillānī (d. 403/1013), *al-Intiṣār li'l-Qur'ān*, ed. Muḥammad 'Iṣām al-Quḍāh (Beirut: Dār Ibn Ḥazm, 1422/2001), 220.

²⁷ Qur'ān 5:67.

verily We are its Preservers (Ḥāfiẓūn).28

Also, the notion of the Qur'ān being revealed according to "seven aḥruf" or of its variant readings is nowhere even hinted at in the Qur'ān itself; the only probable source for such notions seems to be the Ḥadīths and/or extra-Qur'ānic material—which themselves are uncertain and, hence, not worthy to be trusted.

What was the first version of the Qur'an addressed by Jibrīl to the Prophet Muhammad?

The first "version" of the Qur'ān was the same as of today except for the fact that the Qur'ān we have today, expectedly, does not follow a revelational chronological order, from what we can derive from the Qur'ān itself:

Move not with it your tongue, [O Prophet], [so] that you may be hasty with it.

Verily, with Us rests its collection/compilation (jam'ahu) and its reading/recitation (qur'ānahu).

Then when We have read/recited it, then follow its reading/recitation (qur'ānahu).

Moreover, verily, with Us rests its explanation/clarification (bayanahu).29

The last version is usually called al-'arḍah al-akhīrah (الأخيدة العرضة)—meaning "the last presentation" or "the final recital"—which is the same as al-qirā'ah al-'āmmah ("the common reading").

²⁸ Qur'an 15:9.

²⁹ Qur'an 75:16-19.

And it's this "final recital" that the Prophet Muḥammad and, by implication, all Muslims are supposed to follow.³⁰

So it's this "final recital" that we have as the Qur'an today.

Some important excerpts

(1)

... Thus, if the Qur'ān had been transmitted only orally for the first century, sizeable variations between texts such as in the ḥadīth and pre-Islamic poetry would be found, and if it had been transmitted only in writing, sizeable variations such as those in different transmissions of the original document of the Constitution of Medina would be found. But neither is the case with the Qur'ān. There must have been a parallel written transmission limiting variation in the oral transmission to the graphic form, side by side with a parallel oral transmission preserving the written transmission from corruption. The oral transmission of the Qur'ān was essentially static, rather than organic. There was a single text, and nothing, not even allegedly abrogated material, could be taken out, nor anything be put in. This applied even to 'Uthmān, the great gatherer of the text.³¹

(2)

This thesis has attempted to show how Ḥamīd al-Dīn al-Farāhī has shed new light on the collection of the Qur'ān in the light of the Qur'ān itself. It has also presented historical material which stands in line with this account of the Qur'ān and also analyzed some major narratives related to the collection of the Qur'ān which seem to stand in contradiction to this account.

³⁰ Qur'an 75:18: Then when We have read/recited it then follow its reading/recitation (qur'anahu).

³¹ Adrian Alan Brockett, conclusion in "Studies in Two Transmissions of the Qur'ān" (PhD thesis, University of St. Andrews, 1984), 142.

According to al-Farāhī, the Qur'ān clearly says that its text was finalized and collected in the lifetime of the Prophet. This task was not left to his successors. History also shows how this task was accomplished. The Prophet never left any officially compiled codex of the Qur'ān nor any group of officially appointed memorizers as repositories of the Qur'ān. Instead a unique way was adopted: the Qur'ānic text was transferred as a living tradition among the Muslims. Companions wrote out their own copies and also memorized it. The Qur'ān was transmitted both in the oral and in the written form by a vast majority of these Companions. As Muslim authorities have specified, the mechanism of this transmission was tawātur or generation—to—generation transfer.

The collection accounts attributed to each of the first four caliphs Abū Bakr, 'Umar, 'Uthmān and 'Alī, on the other hand, show that the Qur'ān was collected after the demise of the Prophet. As such they are in contradiction to the Qur'ānic account of collection. Moreover, it has been shown that these narratives have serious flaws in both their *matn* and in their *isnād* and cannot be trusted.

Material regarding the codices of two very close companions of the Prophet:

Abdullāh ibn Mas^cūd and Ubayy ibn Ka^cb has also been analyzed. These codices were said to have a different arrangement of the sūrahs as well as some deletions and additions. It is shown that the *matn* and *isnād* of this material is also dubious and cannot be trusted.

A narrative on the placement of Sūrah al-Tawbah and Sūrah al-Anfāl done by "Uthmān is also analyzed. Once again its math and isnād was found to have flaws.

If this historical material is spurious in its details, then the traditional Muslim and Western accounts of Qur'ān collection which are primarily based on material extraneous to the Qur'ān have to be re-assessed and re-evaluated.³²

³² Shehzad Saleem, general conclusions in "Collection of the Qur'an: A Critical and Historical Study of Al-Farāhī's View" (PhD thesis, University of Wales, Lampeter, 2010), 346-7.

Further reading

- Hüseyin Hansu, "Notes on the Term Mutawātir and its Reception in Ḥadīth Criticism",
 Islamic Law and Society, 16 (2009), 383-408 https://www.academia.edu/41901154/
- Bernard Weiss, "Knowledge of the Past: The Theory of Tawātur According to Ghazālī", Studia Islamica, 61 (1985), 81–105 https://www.academia.edu/40935667/
- Wael B. Hallag, "The Authenticity of Prophetic Ḥadīth: a Pseudo-problem", Studia

 Islamica, 89 (1999), 75-90 https://www.academia.edu/40935831/>
- Jonathan A. C. Brown, "Did the Prophet Say It or Not? The Literal, Historical, and Effective Truth of Ḥadīths in Early Sunnism", Journal of the American Oriental Society, 129.2 (2009), 259-85 http://www.drjonathanbrown.com/wp-content/uploads/2011/08/Did-the-Prophet-Say-It-or-Not-PDF.pdf>

Other useful resources

- Variant readings (multiple giraats) of the Qur'an not authentic (Javed Ahmad Ghamidi): YouTube [Urdu] https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=kojtoK1CRnc
- Variant or Multiple Readings (Qirā'āt) of the Qur'ān: Are They Really Authentic?:
 Internet
 https://archive.org/details/VariantOrMultipleReadingsQiraatOfTheQuranAreTheyReallyAuthentic_/
- Muhammad Asad on the Baseless Concept of 'Abrogation (Naskh)': Internet Archive
 https://archive.org/details/MuhammadAsadOnTheBaselessConceptAbrogation_/
- Abrogation, Stoning, Apostasy, and Jihad (The Study Quran): Academia.edu
 https://www.academia.edu/41820101/

Should the Hadiths be followed?

We just saw above that the Ḥadīths do not yield certainty and are uncertain (zannī) at their best.

This leaves us with the an important question: can they still be believed and/or followed?

The Qur'an has the following to say about basing Islam/religion on uncertain (zanni) sources:

And most of them follow not except [mere] zann³³ (doubt; guess; speculation; surmise; uncertainty; ambiguity; equivocality; possibility); verily, the zann does not free [you] from the truth [or take you to the truth] at all; verily, Allah is All-Aware of what[ever] they do.³⁴

And they have no [certain] knowledge thereof; they follow not except the zann; and, verily, the zann does not free [you] from the truth [or take you to the truth] at all.³⁵

And if you follow most of those on the earth they will mislead you from the Way of Allah; they follow not except the zann, and they do not[hing] except conjecture (yakhruṣūn).36

³³ When zann (عَنْم) and 'ilm (عِنْم) are contrasted then they mean "uncertain knowledge" and "certain knowledge" respectively.

³⁴ Qur'ān 10:36.

³⁵ Qur'ān 53:28.

³⁶ Qur'ān 6:116.

﴿ فَذَلَكُمُ اللَّهُ رَبُّكُمُ الْحَقُّ فَمَاذَا بَعْدَ الْحَقِّ إِلَّا الضَّلَالُ فَأَنَّى تُصْرَفُونَ ﴾

So, that is Allah, your Lord, the Truth; then what is there [left] after the truth except error? So, how, then, are you turned away [from the truth]?³⁷

﴿ ثَمَانِيَةَ أَنْوَاجٍ مِنَ الضَّأْنِ اثْنَيْنِ وَمِنَ الْمَعْزِ اثْنَيْنِ قُلْ آلدَّكَرَيْنِ حَرَّمَ أَمِ الْأَنْثَيَيْنِ أَمَّا اشْتَمَلَتْ عَلَيْـهِ أَدْحَـامُ الْأَنْثَيَيْـنِ نَبِّئُـونِي بِعِلْمِ إِنْ كُنْتُمْ صَادِقِينَ ﴾

Eight pairs: of sheep, two, and of goats, two. Say, "Is it the two males He has forbidden or the two females, or that which the wombs of the two females contain? Inform me with [certain] knowledge (bi-'ilm), if you are truthful."

﴿ وَمِنَ الْإِبِكِ اثْنَيْنِ وَمِنَ الْبَقَرِ اثْنَيْنِ قُلْ آلدَّكَرَيْنِ حَرَّمَ أَمِ الْأَنْثَيَيْنِ أَمَّا اشْتَمَلَتْ عَلَيْهِ أَرْحَامُ الْأَنْثَيَيْنِ أَمْ كُنْتُمْ شُهَدَاءَ إِذْ وَصَّاكُمُ اللهُ بِهَذَا فَمَنْ أَظْلَمُ مِمَّنِ افْتَرَى عَلَى اللهِ كَذِبًا لِيُضِلَّ النَّاسَ بِغَيْرِ عِلْمٍ إِنَّ اللهَ لَا يَهْدِي الْقَوْمَ الطَّالِمِينَ ﴾

And of camels, two, and of oxen, two. Say, "Is it the two males He has forbidden or the two females, or that which the wombs of the two females contain? Or were you present when Allah enjoined this upon you?" Then who is more wrong than the one who ascribes a lie to Allah, that he may lead the people astray without [certain] knowledge (bi-ghayr 'ilm)? Truly Allah guides not the wrongdoing people.

﴿ قُلْ لَا أَجِدُ فِي مَا أُوحِيَ إِلَيَّ مُحَرَّمًا عَلَى طَاعِمٍ يَطْعَمُهُ إِلَّا أَنْ يَكُونَ مَيْتَةً أَوْ دَمًا مَسْفُوحًا أَوْ لَحْـمَ خِنْزِيـرٍ فَـإِنَّهُ رِجْـسٌ أَوْ فِسْقًا أُهِلَّ لِفَيْدِ اللهِ بِهِ فَمَنِ اضْطُرَّ غَيْرَ بَاغِ وَلَا عَادٍ فَإِنَّ رَبِّكَ غَفُورٌ رَحِيمٌ ﴾

Say, "I do not find in that which has been revealed to me [anything] forbidden for an eater to eat of except that it be what has died of itself, or blood poured forth, or flesh of swine—for that surely is filth—or that which is a transgression, other than [the name of] Allah having been invoked on it; but whoever is compelled by necessity,

³⁷ Qur'an 10:32.

without wilfully disobeying or transgressing, then surely your Lord is Forgiving, Merciful."

﴿ وَعَلَى الَّذِينَ هَادُوا حَرَّمْنَا كُلَّ ذِي ظُفُرٍ وَمِنَ الْبَقَرِ وَالْغَنَمِ حَرَّمْنَا عَلَيْهِمْ شُحُومَهُمَا إِلَّا مَا حَمَلَتْ ظُهُورُهُمَا أَوِ الْحَوَايَا أَوْ مَا الْخَلَطَ بَعَظْم ذَلكَ جَزَيْنَاهُمْ بِبَغْيِهِمْ وَإِنَّا لَصَادِقُونَ ﴾

And to those who are Jews We forbade every animal with claws; and of oxen and sheep We forbade them the fat thereof, except that upon their backs or their entrails or that which is mingled with bone: thus did We recompense them for their wilful disobedience, and surely We are truthful.

Then if they deny you, say, "Your Lord is [the Lord] of All-encompassing mercy, and His Might will not be averted from the guilty people."

Those who are polytheists will say, "Had Allah willed, we would not have ascribed partners to Allah nor our fathers, nor would we have forbidden anything;" those who were before them had similarly denied, till they tasted Our Might. Say, "Do you have any [certain] knowledge ('ilm) that you can produce for us? You follow not except the zann, and you do not[hing] but conjecture (takhruṣūn)."

From the aforementioned verses of the Qur'ān, it is crystal clear that, in matters pertaining to Islam/religion,

- following zann is the characteristic of the unguided/misguided/wrong people (the polytheists, for instance)
- 2. following zann cannot lead a person to the truth or the desired destination (which is God and Paradise, for a Muslim believer)
- 3. whatever is not the truth/right is error/wrong 39

³⁸ Qur'ān 6:143-8.

³⁹ The "permissible/optional (إُحَدَام)" is a middle, neutral category between the "prohibited (ḥarām; وَحَدَام)"

- 4. Islam/religion cannot be based on uncertain (zanni) sources (such as the Ḥadīths)
- 5. nothing can be deemed prohibited (ḥarām) or, conversely, obligatory (farḍ)—both of which are God's injunctions and thus form part of His Religion/Islam—whenever there is any kind of zann involved, whether pertaining to either authenticity (thubūt; عبدت) or meaning (dalālah; دلالة).

Thus, the aforementioned verses of the Qur'an condemn and prohibit beyond doubt the use of the Hadiths as a source or part of Islam/religion.

and the "obligatory (fard; فَنْف)", since, by definition, the halal is neither a part/injunction of Islam/religion nor against it; see also Shees Hassan Shaikh, "Five types of acts in Islamic law (multilingual)", Academia.edu https://www.academia.edu/41452754/ accessed 21 February 2020.

The Original Sources of Islam

Many confuse the Ḥadīth(s)—meaning "saying(s)" or "narration(s)"—and the Sunnah—meaning "practice"—to be one and the same, and although the two differ significantly from one another—both lexically 40 as well as conceptually 41—the two words are being, and have been, used more or less interchangeably by the Muslim laity as well as the intelligentsia, whether knowingly or unknowingly, whether intentionally or unintentionally.

The original sources of Islam are not the Qur'an and the Ḥadīths but rather the Qur'an and the Sunnah, or more precisely, the mutawātir Sunnah of the Prophet(s) of Allah.

The mutawātir Sunnah, as distinct from the Ḥadīths, as one of the two sources of Islam—the other being the Qur'ān—is no new concept to the Muslims scholars of the past.⁴²

⁴⁰ Lane, Arabic-English Lexicon, ii (London: Williams and Norgate, 1865; Beirut: Librairie du Liban, 1968), 527-8, 529, under "2.

"وقيم " respectively < http://lexicon.quranic-research.net/data/06_H/039_Hdv.html accessed 21 February 2020; ibid. iv (London: Williams and Norgate, 1872 (repr.); Beirut: Librairie du Liban, 1968), 1436, 1438, under "1.

"" and "قيم " respectively " respectively " and "قيم " respectively " and " " respectively " r

⁴¹ Adis Duderija, "Evolution in the Concept of Sunnah during the First Four Generations of Muslims in Relation to the Development of the Concept of an Authentic Ḥadīth as based on Recent Western Scholarship", Arab Law Quarterly, 26 (2012), 393-437 https://www.academia.edu/7885137/> accessed 21 February 2020.

See, for instance, Majid Kahdduri, trans., al-Imām Muḥammad ibn Idrīs al-Shāfirīs al-Risāla fī Uṣūl al-Fiqh: Treatise on the Foundations of Islamic Jurisprudence, or, al-Shāfirīs al-Risāla: Treatise on the Foundations of Islamic Jurisprudence: Shāfirīs Risāla (2nd ed., Cambridge, UK: The Islamic Texts Society, [1987]), 289 para. 495; 81-2 paras 29-32; Muḥammad ibn Idrīs al-Shāfirī (d. 204/820), al-Risālah, ed. Ahmad Muḥammad Shākir ([Cairo]: Shirkah Maktabah wa-Maṭbarah Muṣṭafā al-Bābī al-Halabī wa-Awlāduhu, 1358/1940), 478 para. 1329; 357-9 paras 961-5; Abū rumar rusuf Ibn rabd al-Barr (d. 463/1071), Jāmir Bayān al-Ilm wa-Faḍlihi, ed. Abū rl-Ashbāl al-Zuhayrī, i (Dammam: Dār Ibn al-Jawzī, 1414/1994), 779-80 para. 1452; Abū rusuf yarqūb ibn Ibrāhīm al-Anṣārī (d. 182/798), al-Radd ralā Siyar al-Awzārī, ed. Abū rl-Wafā al-Afghānī (Hyderabad, India: Lajnah Iḥyār al-Marārif al-Nurmāniyyah, 1357/[1938]), 31-2; rīsā ibn Abān (d. 221/836) in Abū Bakr Aḥmad ibn ralī al-Rāzī al-Jaṣṣāṣ (d. 370/981), Uṣūl al-Fiqh, or, al-Fuṣūl fī rl-Uṣūl, ed. rujayl Jāsim al-Nashamī, iii ([2nd ed.], [Kuwait City]: Wizārah al-Awqāf wa'l-Shu'ūn al-Islāmiyyah, [1414/1194]), 113; Abū Bakr Aḥmad ibn ralī ibn Thābit al-Khaṭīb al-Baghdādī (d. 463/1071), al-Kifāyah fī Marifah Uṣūl rīm al-Riwāyah, ed. Ibrāhīm ibn Muṣṭafā Āl Baḥjah al-Dimyāṭī, ii (Mit Ghamr: Dār al-Hudā,

The Pakistani-born research scholar of Islam Javed Ahmad Ghamidi has prepared a definite and exhaustive list of the *mutawātir* sunnahs/sunan. He defines the Sunnah and lists the acts or practices handed down to us by it as follows:

By Sunnah is meant that tradition of [the] Prophet Abraham's religion which the Prophet Muḥammad instituted among his followers as religion after reviving and reforming it and after making certain additions to it. The Qur'ān has directed Muḥammad to obey the religion of Abraham. This tradition is a part of it:

Then We revealed to you to follow the religion of Abraham, who was truly devoted and was not among the polytheists. (16:123)

The following portion of Islam has been given to us through the Sunnah:

Worship Rituals

- i. the prayer [ṣalāh]
- ii. zakāh [zakāt] and ṣadagah of 'Īd al-Fiţr
- iii. fasting [sawm] and ictikāf
- iv. hajj and cumrah
- v. animal sacrifice and the takbīrs during the days of tashrīg

Social Sphere

- i. marriage and divorce, and their relevant details
- ii. abstention from coitus during the menstrual and the puerperal period

Dietary Sphere

i. prohibition of pork, blood, meat of dead animals, and animals slaughtered in

^{1423/2003),} **557**; Abū Muḥammad ʿAlī ibn Aḥmad Ibn Ḥazm al-Andalusī (d. 456/1064), *al-Iḥkām fī Uṣūl al-Aḥkām*, ed. Aḥmad Muḥammad Shākir, i (¡Beirut: Dār al-Āfāq al-Jadīdah, [1400/1979]), **104**; Shāh Walī Allāh ibn ʿAbd al-Raḥīm al-Dihlawī (d. 1176/1762), *Ḥujjah Allāh al-Bālighah*, ed. al-Sayyid Sābiq, i (¡Beirut: Dār al-Jīl, 1426/2005), **228**.

the name of someone other than Allah

ii. slaughtering in the prescribed manner of tadhkiyah by pronouncing Allah's name

Customs and Etiquette

- remembering Allah's name before eating or drinking, and using the right hand for eating and drinking
- ii. greeting one another with al-sālam 'alaykum ("peace be to you") and responding with wa-'alaykum al-salām ("and peace be to you")
- iii. saying al-ḥamd li'l-Lāh ("praise be to Allah") after sneezing and responding to it by saying yarḥamuk Allāh ("may Allah have mercy on you")
- iv. keeping moustaches trimmed
- v. shaving pubic hair
- vi. removing the hair under the armpits
- vii. paring fingernails
- viii.circumcising the male offspring
- ix. cleaning the nose, the mouth, and the teeth
- x. cleaning the body after excretion and urination
- xi. bathing after the menstrual and the puerperal periods
- xii. ghusl al-janābah²
- xiii. bathing the dead before burial
- xiv. enshrouding the dead body and preparing it for burial
- xv. burying the dead
- xvi. 'Id al-Fitr
- xvii. 'Id al-Adhā

This is all what the Sunnah is, and it can be said with certainty that there is no

difference between it and the Qur'ān as far as their authenticity is concerned. Just as the Qur'ān has been received by the ummah through the consensus of the Prophet's Companions and through their perpetual recitation, the Sunnah has been received by it through their consensus and through their perpetual practice and stands validated like the Qur'ān in every period of time through the consensus of the ummah. Consequently, there is no doubt or debate about it now.

All that is Islam is constituted by these two sources. Nothing besides these two is Islam or can be regarded as its part. ... 43

- 1. The eleventh, twelfth and thirteenth of Dhū 'l-Ḥajj. (Translator)
- 2. The ceremonial bath performed after ejaculation or after sexual intercourse. (Translator)

Other useful resources

- Muslim scholars on the mutawatir sunnah; Internet Archive
 https://archive.org/details/muslimscholarsonthemutawatirsunnah/
- Original Sources of Islam: Sunnah vs Hadith (Javed Ahmad Ghamidi) [English subtitles]:
 YouTube [Urdu] https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=qkuV7acIwUg
- How to identify mutawatir Sunnah? (Inkar-e-Hadith aur Javed Ahmad Ghamidi):
 YouTube [Urdu] https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1Gze5HuuOLA
- Javed Ahmad Ghamidi on Hadith: Al-Mawrid < http://www.al-mawrid.org/index.php/articles/view/javed-ahmad-ghaamidii-on-hadiith>

⁴³ Javed Ahmad Ghamidi, "Fundamental Principles", in *Islam: A Comprehensive Introduction*, trans. Shehzad Saleem (Lahore: Al-Mawrid, [2009]), 17–19 https://www.academia.edu/42033789/ accessed 21 February 2020 (published in the original Urdu as *Mīzān* (5th ed., Lahore: Al-Mawrid, [2009])). The list may be debatable, and although other scholars do cite a few examples for the *mutawātir* sunnahs, Ghamidi is the only scholar, to my knowledge, who claims to have prepared such an exhaustive and precise list of the *mutawātir* sunnahs, which, in my eyes, is praiseworthy.

- Sunnah vs. Hadith (Follow Up 3: Definition of Established Sunnah): Exploring-Islam
 http://www.exploring-islam.com/sunnah-vs-hadith-follow-up-3-definition-of-established-sunnah-2.html>
- Sunnah Verses Hadith (Follow Up 4: Beard): Exploring-Islam < http://www.exploring-islam.com/sunnah-verses-hadith-follow-up-4-beard.html>
- Established Sunnah: Some Technical Questions: Exploring-Islam
 https://www.exploring-islam.com/established-sunnah-some-technical-questions.html
- keeping of a man's hair as part of sunnah: Islam.com
 hair_as_part_of_sunnah

Shees Hassan

shees1993@rediff.com

25 February 2020